



Report to: Transport Committee

Date: 10 March 2023

Subject: Project Approvals

Director: Dave Haskins, Director of Transport Policy and Delivery (Interim)

Author: Craig Taylor, Head of Portfolio Management and Appraisal

1 Purpose of this report

1.1 To report on proposals for the progression of, and funding for projects under Investment Priority 5 – Delivering Sustainable, Inclusive and Affordable Transport, within the West Yorkshire Investment Strategy (WYIS), that have been considered at stages 1, 2 and 3 of the Combined Authority's assurance process.







- 1.2 The Transport Committee has delegated decision making authority approved by the Combined Authority on 23 June 2022. Where the Transport Committee is asked to make an approval decision this will be highlighted in the summary table and made clear in the recommendations.
- 1.3 The recommendations can be found in Section 12 of this report.

2 Report

- 2.1 This report presents proposals for the progression of schemes through the Combined Authority's assurance process in line with the Combined Authority's Assurance Framework. Further details on the schemes summarised below can be found as part of this report.
- 2.2 For more detail on the Combined Authority's Assurance Framework through which each of the schemes outlined in this report are being approved is provided in **Appendix 1**.

Investment Priority 5 (IP5) - Delivering Sustainable, Inclusive and Affordable Transport

- 3.1 The West Yorkshire Investment Strategy (WYIS) sets out the Investment Priorities for the period 1 April 2021 to 31 March 2024 across six areas. In each, a number of priority project / programme areas have been identified that are the focus for intervention.
- 3.2 Investment Priority 5 will deliver a range of programmes and schemes which focus on:
 - Creating an affordable, simple, integrated, and accessible system for people to travel anywhere by public transport
 - Increasing passenger numbers on bus, rail, and future transport networks
 - Improving air quality and reduction in car dominance
 - Ensuring that people are enabled to make sustainable travel choices from housing and employment sites.
 - Transforming access for communities of persistent poverty, where households have prolonged experiences of poverty, to employment opportunities and skills centres
 - Enhancements in ticketing and travel information
 - Buses being an effective and affordable mode of transport.
 - Enhancing customer satisfaction with public transport.

Scheme summaries

TCF Bradford Interchange Station Access

Bradford

Scheme description

The scheme aims to create a world-class, vibrant gateway to Bradford that enables safe, seamless interchange between all transport modes, which supports the creation of a thriving city centre, to increase investment and growth, resulting in more jobs and opportunities. This will be delivered through:

- Improvements to the interchange's lower-level concourse to make it easy to use and a more attractive and secure environment
- Clearer, more intuitive wayfinding and customer information to help users transferring between the interchange's rail and bus stations
- An attractive paved plaza outside the interchange with planting, artwork, and seating to replace the current congested taxi and drop off areas
- A new, taxi rank and accessible drop off on Bridge Street
- Demolition of the Hall Ings multi-storey car park and creation of a new attractive, landscaped walkway between the interchange and Hall Ings, giving pedestrians direct access to the city centre and better connections for cyclists travelling between the interchange and city centre.

The scheme is funded by the Transforming Cities Fund and the West Yorkshire plus Transport Fund.

Impact

The scheme is expected to drive up bus and rail passenger numbers and remove barriers to make it easier to walk or travel by bike between the interchange and city centre, encouraging more people to walk, cycle, or use public transport rather than cars. This will contribute to wider efforts to make Bradford city centre a safer, more welcoming and accessible place. The scheme also includes new green space in the Hall Ings walkway.

Improving the city gateway is expected to increase investment and growth, resulting in more jobs and opportunities.

The scheme results in a carbon saving of 417 tonnes over the 60-year appraisal period, with the operational carbon saving being sufficient to outweigh the capital carbon emissions during scheme construction.

The value for money assessment reflects a benefit cost ratio (BCR) of 1.28:1. This is categorised as Low value for money.

Decision sought

Approval to proceed through decision point 3 (outline business case) and work commences on activity 4 (full business case).

Total value of the scheme - £22,031,000

Total value of Combined Authority funding - £22,031,000

Funding recommendation sought - £2,054,127

A decision by the Transport Committee using the delegated authority from the Combined Authority is sought as part of this report

Other decisions relevant to the Transport Committee

3.3 Since project approvals were last reported to the Transport Committee on 16 December 2022, the following decisions have been made which are relevant to the Transport Committee.

Decisions made by the Combined Authority on 2 February 2023

- 3.4 The following schemes have recently been assessed in line with the Combined Authority's assurance process and approved by the Combined Authority.
- 3.5 The full agenda and papers for the meeting can be found on the <u>Combined</u> <u>Authority website here.</u>

Transformational – North East Calderdale	Approval of decision point 2 (strategic outline case) and for work to commence on activity 3 (outline business case).		
Calderdale	Funding approved - £1,560,000		
	Total indicative value of the scheme - £78,400,000 to £88,100,000		
	Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding - £4,300,000.		
CRSTS Asset Management and Enhancement Programme and Off	Approval of decision point 2 (strategic outline case) and decision point 4 (full business case) and to continue work on activity 5 (delivery) for the financial year 2022/23 and quarter 1 of 2023/24.		
Highway Walking and Cycling Network	Funding approved:		
Wakefield, Bradford, Calderdale, Kirklees, Leeds	• £24,800,000 of development and delivery costs for quarter 3 and quarter 4 of 2022/3 for CRSTS Asset Management Programme (year 1) plus £12,400,000 for quarter 1 of 2023/24 (year 2).		
	• £344,000 of development and delivery costs for quarter 3 and quarter 4 of 2022/23 for the Off Highway Walking and Cycling network programme plus £172,000 for quarter 1 of 2023/24 (year 2).		
	Total indicative value of the scheme:		
	£248,000,000 for CRSTS Asset Management and		
	£3,440,000 for Off Highway Walking and Cycling Network		
	Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding:		
	£248,000,000 for CRSTS Asset Management and		
	£3,440,000 for Off Highway Walking and Cycling Network		

CRSTS Network Management Renewals and Enhancements Wakefield, Bradford, Calderdale, Kirklees, Leeds	Approval of decision point 2 (strategic outline case) and for work to commence on activity 5 (delivery). Funding approved - £1,862,500 of development and delivery costs for quarter 3 and quarter 4 of 2022/3 (year 1) plus £931,250 for quarter 1 of 2023/24 (year 2). Total value of the scheme - £25,000,000 Total value of Combined Authority funding - £25,000,000
CRSTS Safer Roads Wakefield, Bradford, Calderdale, Kirklees, Leeds	Approval of decision point 2 (strategic outline case) and decision point 4 (full business case) and for work to commence on activity 5 (delivery). Funding approved - £2,500,000 of development and delivery costs for quarter 3 and quarter 4 of 2022/3 (year 1) plus £1,250,000 for quarter 1 of 2023/24 (year 2). Total value of the scheme - £25,000,000 Total value of Combined Authority funding - £25,000,000
Leeds City Centre – City Square Plus – Thirsk Row Leeds	Approval of the change request for £939,000 to progress the scheme to activity 5 (delivery) and to extend the delivery timescale to July 2023. Funding approved - £939,000 Total value of the Thirsk Row scheme - £1,500,000 Total value of the City Square Plus scheme - £12,174,000 Total value of Combined Authority funding - £12,024,000

3.6 The following decision points and change requests have been assessed in line with the Combined Authority's assurance process and approved through the agreed delegations to:

Decisions made by the Combined Authority's Chief Executive

Corridor Improvement Programme A6177 Great Horton Road – Horton Grange Road	Approval to the change request for the Corridor Improvement Programme A6177 Great Horton Road – Horton Grange Road scheme to increase the indicative funding by £1,800,000 to £6,257,000
Bradford	Funding approved: £1,800,000
	Total indicative value of the scheme: £6, 257,000
	Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding: £6,257,000
Corridor Improvement Programme A6177 Thornton Road –	Approval to the change request for the Corridor Improvement Programme A6177 Thornton Road – Toller Lane to reduce the indicative funding by £1,800,000 to £10,210,000
Toller Lane	Funding approved: -£1,800,000
Bradford	Total indicative value of the scheme: £10,210,000
	Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding: £ TBC

3.7 Under the delegation, no additional funding was approved, due to the indicative funding being reduced for the Corridor Improvement Programme A6177 Thornton Road – Toller Lane scheme. The decisions were made by the

Chief Executive following a recommendation from the Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team.

Decisions made by the Combined Authority's Chief Operating Officer

Glasshoughton Southern Link Road Wakefield	Approval to the project closure report for the Glasshoughton Southern Link Road scheme and for the scheme to proceed through decision point 6 and work continue towards Monitoring and Evaluation closure. Funding approved: £ nil Total value of the scheme: £5,409,059 Total value of Combined Authority funding: £5,409,059
	Total value of Combined Admonty funding. £5,409,039
Wakefield Eastern Relief Road Wakefield	Approval to the project closure report for the Wakefield Eastern Relief Road scheme and for the scheme to proceed through decision point 5 and work to continue towards financial closure (DP6) and Monitoring and Evaluation closure.
	Funding approved: £ nil
	Total value of the scheme: £37,593,000
	Total value of Combined Authority funding: £37,593,000
Leeds Station Gateway – New Station Street Leeds	Approval to the project closure report for the Leeds Station Gateway – New Station Street project, and for the scheme to proceed through decision points 5 and 6 (delivery & financial closure) and work to continue towards monitoring & evaluation closure
	Funding approved: £ nil
	Total value of the scheme: £2,007,220
	Total value of Combined Authority funding: £2,007,220
TCF: A639 Bus - Cycle - Walking Improvements Leeds / Wakefield	Approval to the change request for the A639 Bus – Cycle – Walking Improvements scheme to change Senior Responsible Officer duties to Leeds City Council from Wakefield City Council and to release further development funding of £450,000. Funding approved: £450,000
	Total indicative value of the scheme: £10,860,000
	Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding:
	£10,860,000
TCF: A61 Bus – Cycle – Walking Improvements Leeds / Wakefield	Approval to the change request for the A61 Bus – Cycle – Walking Improvements scheme to change the Senior Responsible Officer and lead promoter to Leeds City Council from Wakefield City Council and to release further development funding of £450,000.
	Funding approved: £450,000
	Total indicative value of the scheme: £11,568,000
	Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding: £11,568,000

TCF: A64 Bus – Cycle – Walking Improvements Leeds	Approval to the change request for the A64 Bus – Cycle – Walking Improvements scheme to release further development costs of £715,000, taking the total approval to £1,395,400 Funding approved: £715,000 Total indicative value of the scheme: £22,000,000 Total indicative value of Combined Authority funding: £2,680,400 (as per inflation review approval)
City Connect Phase 3 - Canals - Leeds Liverpool - Shipley Bradford	Approval to the project closure report for the City Connect Phase 3 – Canals – Leeds Liverpool - Shipley project, and for the scheme to proceed through decision point 5 and work to continue on financial closure and Benefits Realisation Funding approved: £ nil Total value of the scheme: £1,981,000 Total value of Combined Authority funding: £1,331,539
Leeds Inland Port Leeds	Approval to the project closure report for the Leeds Inland Port project and for the scheme to proceed through decision points 5 and 6 (delivery & financial closure) as the scheme did not proceed to delivery. Funding approved: £ nil Total value of the scheme: £ nil Total value of Combined Authority funding: £ nil

3.8 Under the delegation £1,615,000 was approved. The decisions were made by the Combined Authority's Chief Operating Officer, following a recommendation from the Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team.

4 Information

- 4.1 The Combined Authority's assurance framework requires that formal approval is given to the following elements of a scheme as part of its development:
 - The progression of a scheme through a decision point to the next activity.
 - Indicative or full approval to the total value of the scheme funding requested.
 - The Combined Authority's entry into a funding agreement with the scheme's promoter.
 - The assurance pathway and approval route for future decision points.
 - The scheme's approval tolerances.
- 4.2 This report provides information required to enable the Combined Authority to approve each of the above elements.

Projects in Stage 1: Assessment and Sequencing

4.3 There are no schemes to review at this stage.

Projects in Stage 2: Scheme development

Project Title	TCF Bradford Interchange Station Access	
Stage	2 (scheme development)	
Decision Point	3 (outline business case)	

Is this a key decision?		□ No
Is the decision eligible for call-in by Scrutiny?		□ No
Does the report contain confidential or exempt information or appendices?	☐ Yes	⊠ No
If relevant, state paragraph number of Schedule 12A, Local Government Act 1972, Part 1:		
Are there implications for equality and diversity?	⊠ Yes	□ No

Background

- 4.4 As part of the Government's Industrial Strategy and the National Productivity Investment Fund, the Transforming Cities Fund (TCF) aims to drive up productivity through improved connections between urban centres and suburbs. To do this, the TCF provides a significant opportunity to invest in infrastructure to improve public and sustainable transport connectivity in some of England's largest cities.
- 4.5 The TCF programme is organised into three themes which focus on improving public transport and cycling corridors, improving accessibility to key locations, and improving transport hubs and Interchange facilities.
- 4.6 This scheme is currently being funded from the Transforming Cities Fund (TCF) and the West Yorkshire plus Transport Fund (WY+TF).
- 4.7 The ability of Bradford Interchange to act as a worthy gateway to the city is currently limited by:
 - Its location, hidden behind unattractive buildings, including the multistorey car park on Hall Ings
 - The poor quality of its facilities, especially in the lower-level concourse which is the entrance / exit point for the rail and bus stations
 - Hall Ings acting as a barrier for pedestrians walking between the interchange, and the wider city centre.

- 4.8 The scheme's vision is to create a world-class, vibrant gateway to Bradford that enables safe, seamless interchange between all transport modes, that supports the creation of a thriving city centre, driving jobs, opportunity and economic growth, addressing the challenges and achieving the vision through:
 - Improvements to the facilities and environment in the interchange's lower-level concourse to make it more attractive, secure, and easy to use
 - Clearer, more intuitive wayfinding and customer information to help users transferring between the interchange's rail and bus stations
 - An attractive paved plaza outside the interchange with planting, artwork and seating to replace the current congested taxi and drop off areas.
 - A new, easily accessible taxi rank and accessible drop off on Bridge Street.
 - Demolition of the unattractive Hall Ings multi-storey car park, with enabling works carried out during full business case development to minimise any potential for delays in the scheme programme.
- 4.9 A new attractive, landscaped walkway between the interchange and Hall Ings, giving pedestrians direct access to the city centre and its attractions and better connections for cyclists travelling between the interchange and city centre.

 The scheme links to the Strategic Economic Framework (SEF) priorities of:
 - Boosting Productivity
 - Enabling Inclusive Growth
 - Tackling the Climate Emergency, and
 - Delivering 21st Century Transport.
- 4.10 The scheme also directly supports several of the Mayor's pledges, including prioritising skills and training, supporting local businesses and the economy, and tackling the climate emergency.
- 4.11 A summary of the scheme's business case and location map is included in **Appendix 2**.

Tackling the Climate Emergency Implications

- 4.12 The scheme is expected to drive up passenger numbers for bus and rail, promoting a shift from car to public transport and will remove barriers to cycling and walking, promoting a shift from motorised vehicles.
- 4.13 The scheme will provide new green space in the new walkway from the interchange to Hall Ings
- 4.14 The scheme is expected to deliver 417 tonnes of carbon dioxide equivalent (CO2e) savings over the 60-year appraisal period, with the operational carbon savings over this period outweighing the capital carbon emissions produced during construction.

Outputs and Benefits

- 4.15 The scheme outputs and benefits include:
 - A high-quality route between the interchange and city centre providing easier access to employment, training, and learning opportunities and cultural activities
 - Improving the quality of the interchange and its approaches to produce a more attractive gateway to the city
 - Increase in number of rail and bus users using the interchange
 - An improved interchange, better able to accommodate the forecast future growth in passengers, through improvements including upgrading staircases, installation of a changing places toilet and more seating.
 - Reduction in walking time from interchange to key city points as a result of improved access to Bridge Street and the Hall Ings walkway
 - Taxi and drop off facilities which are more accessible and attractive
 - Better connectivity between different transport types
 - The scheme presents a Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR) of 1.28:1 which is categorised as Low value for money. Government guidance advises that the BCR is only one factor in the appraisal and factors such as a strong strategic case can be considered when considering the overall business case.

Inclusive Growth Implications

- 4.16 The scheme inclusive growth implications include:
 - Removing barriers to healthy low-cost active travel (cycling and walking).
 - Improving the accessibility and attractiveness of public transport.
 - Improved access to the city centre and the surrounding areas for employment, education, retail, and leisure purposes.
 - Improving a key gateway into Bradford city centre which is expected to drive up investment, creating more jobs and opportunities.

Equality and Diversity Implications

- 4.17 An Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) has been undertaken for the scheme and equality and diversity impacts taken account of as part of the development of the scheme and the business case development.
- 4.18 The scheme provides a landscaped, traffic free walkway linking Hall Ings to the interchange and a new plaza to the front of the interchange which provides an accessible and more welcoming gateway, improving perceptions of safety and security which will benefit protected characteristic groups.
- 4.19 The internal improvements to the interchange improve accessibility through new seating, better signing and wayfinding, improved stairs, handrails, and lighting.

- 4.20 The scheme will deliver improved access to key employment, education, community and recreational facilities via improved connectivity and pedestrianisation of the area, benefitting protected characteristic groups that are more likely to experience isolation and social exclusion.
- 4.21 The scheme will reduce noise and improve air quality through reduced traffic benefitting protected characteristic groups.
- 4.22 There may be some potential detrimental impacts to accessibility due to the taxi rank, blue badge parking and drop off area being moved further from the interchange entrance onto a street which has a gradient. There are also potentially some detrimental impacts during construction works which can be mitigated via the Construction Travel Plan which will be produced in the next stage of scheme development.

Risks

- 4.23 The scheme risks include:
 - No agreement to use third-party land, mitigated by City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council (CBMDC) seeking agreement with the third party. Engagement is already underway with a view to secure agreement in advance of submission of the scheme's full business case.
 - Scheme is not delivered in time for Bradford's City of Culture 2025 event, mitigated by liaison between the Combined Authority and CBMDC to explore opportunities to reduce delivery timeframes.
 - Increased costs due to inflation. This will be mitigated through a range of measures including using robust inflation checks against relevant indices during business case development, to ensure forecasts are accurate, using Balfour Beatty Group's procurement to secure, labour, plant, and materials at framework rates, using the group's negotiated rate and negotiating and placing bulk orders for materials.
 - Not gaining approval from stakeholders, especially taxi operators and mobility groups, mitigated by ongoing consultation with stakeholders and where feasible / agreed, stakeholder feedback will be considered in the development of the detailed design.

Costs

- 4.24 The total scheme costs are £22,031,000.
- 4.25 The Combined Authority's contribution is £22,031,000 in total, comprising £5,650,000 from West Yorkshire plus Transport Fund and £16,381,000 from the Transforming Cities Fund (TCF).
- 4.26 Approval is sought for development costs and enabling works totalling £2,054,127. This brings the total scheme approval to £8,751,849. The Combined Authority, subject to decision point 3 approval (outline business case), will need to enter into an addendum to the existing funding agreement with CBMDC for expenditure of up to £8,751,849.

Assurance Pathway and Approval Route

Assurance pathway	Approval route	Forecast approval date
3 (outline business case)	Recommendation: Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team Decision: Transport Committee	10/03/2023
4 (full business case)	Recommendation: Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team Decision: Combined Authority's Chief Executive	26/07/2023
Approval to Proceed	Recommendation: Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team Decision: Combined Authority's Chief Operating Officer	27/09/2023
5 (delivery)	Recommendation: Combined Authority's Programme Appraisal Team Decision: Combined Authority's Chief Operating Officer	06/06/2025

Other Key Timescales

- May 2023 Commence demolition of car park
- November 2023 Start construction
- January 2024 Complete demolition of car park
- December 2024 Major works completion
- June 2025 Minor works and full scheme completion

Assurance Tolerances

Assurance tolerances

Combined Authority costs remain within +5% of those outlined in this report.

Delivery (DP5) timescales remain within 6 months of those outlined in this report.

Benefits:

Bus User Benefits remain within -10% of those stated in the outline business case.

Rail User Benefits remain within -10% of those stated in the outline business case.

Pedestrian walking time benefits remain within -10% of those stated in the outline business case. \cdot

Appraisal Summary

4.27 The scheme presents a strong strategic case with the case for change and investment clearly set out and links to several Strategic Economic Framework

- (SEF) priorities. The scheme also directly supports several West Yorkshire Mayoral Pledges and supports policy at national, regional, and local levels.
- 4.28 The scheme forms part of the Bradford city centre TCF programme and has close links to the TCF Bradford City Centre Cycling and Walking Improvements scheme.
 - The business case demonstrates the demand for the scheme and includes a clear procurement strategy. Affordability has been demonstrated with the scheme costs being fully funded from a combination of funding from the WY+TF and TCF.
 - The economic case is less well established with the scheme currently returning a benefit cost ratio (BCR) of 1.28:1, which represents low value for money. There are also some concerns arising in the appraisal which may mean that the BCR could be lower, meaning the actual category could be Poor value for money. Government guidance advises that the BCR is only one factor in the appraisal and factors such as a strong strategic case can be considered when considering the overall business case. The BCR position will become clearer in the next stage of scheme development.
- 4.29 The management case highlights concern around stakeholder engagement, some of which may be seen to exacerbate risks associated with securing third party agreements which are essential to deliver the scheme. However, further engagement work will be carried out and the position on the third-party agreements should become clearer.
- 4.30 Overall, the submission offers sufficient assurance to recommend that the outline business case be approved, and work commences on development of the full business case.

Recommendations

- 4.31 The Transport Committee approves that:
 - (i) The TCF Bradford Interchange Access scheme proceeds through decision point 3 (outline business case) and work commences on activity 4 (full business case).
 - (ii) Development costs of £2,054,127 are approved in order to progress the scheme to decision point 4 (full business case) taking the total scheme approval to £8,751,849.
 - (iii) The Combined Authority enters into an addendum to the existing funding agreement with City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council for expenditure of up to £8,751,849.
 - (iv) Future approvals are made in accordance with the assurance pathway and approval route outlined in this report. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in this report.

Projects in Stage 3: Delivery and Evaluation

4.32 There are no schemes to review at this stage.

5 Tackling the Climate Emergency implications

5.1 The Climate Emergency implications have been considered on all projects included in this report as part of their business case development.

6 Inclusive Growth implications

6.1 The inclusive growth implications have been considered on all projects included in this report as part of their business case development.

7 Equality and Diversity implications

7.1 Equality Impact Assessments (EqIA) have been undertaken on all projects included in this report as part of their business case development.

8 Financial implications

8.1 The report seeks endorsement to expenditure from the available Combined Authority funding as set out in this report.

9 Legal implications

9.1 The payment of funding to any recipient will be subject to a funding agreement being in place between the Combined Authority and the organisation in question.

10 Staffing implications

10.1 A combination of Combined Authority and local partner council project, programme and portfolio management resources are, or are in the process of, being identified and costed for within the scheme in this report.

11 External consultees

11.1 Where applicable scheme promoters have been consulted on the content of this report.

12 Recommendations (Summary)

TCF Bradford Interchange Station Access

12.1 The Transport Committee approves that:

- (i) The TCF Bradford Interchange Access scheme proceeds through decision point 3 (outline business case) and work commences on activity 4 (full business case).
- (ii) Development costs of £2,054,127 are approved in order to progress the scheme to decision point 4 (full business case) taking the total scheme approval to £8,751,849.
- (iii) The Combined Authority enters into an addendum to the existing funding agreement with City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council for expenditure of up to £8,751,849.
- (iv) Future approvals are made in accordance with the assurance pathway and approval route outlined in this report. This will be subject to the scheme remaining within the tolerances outlined in this report.

13 Background Documents

13.1 None as part of this report.

14 Appendices

Appendix 1 - Assurance Framework

Appendix 2 – TCF Bradford Interchange Station Access – Business Case Summary